



REPUBLIC OF THE PHILIPPINES
SENATE ELECTORAL TRIBUNAL
COA-NCR Bldg., Batasan Road, Quezon City

FRANCIS N. TOLENTINO,
Protestant,

-versus -

SET CASE No. 001-16

LEILA M. DE LIMA,
Protestee.

X----- X

RESOLUTION NO. 16-45-A

AMENDED PRELIMINARY CONFERENCE ORDER

At the Preliminary Conference in this case conducted by the Tribunal *En Banc* on 26 January 2017 at the Supreme Court *En Banc* Conference Room, Second Floor, Supreme Court Building I, Padre Faura, Manila starting at 11:15 o'clock in the morning, Protestant Francis N. Tolentino and his lead counsel, Atty. Pacifico A. Agabin, and counsel for Protestee Leila M. de Lima, Atty. Teddy Esteban F. Rigoroso, appeared. Atty. Rigoroso presented a Special Power of Attorney executed by Protestee de Lima, authorizing him to appear for and represent her in the proceedings.

I. ADMITTED FACTS AND DOCUMENTS

A. Facts Admitted by Both Parties:

1. Protestant Tolentino and Protestee de Lima were among the fifty (50) duly-registered candidates who vied for the position of Senator of the Republic of the Philippines in the 09 May 2016 Automated National and Local Elections.

2. On 10 May 2016, the Commission on Elections *En Banc* convened as the National Board of Canvassers pursuant to Comelec Resolution No. 10111 dated 03 May 2016.
 3. On 19 May 2016, the COMELEC-NBOC issued Resolution No. 007-16 and proceeded to proclaim as duly-elected senators the twelve (12) candidates who obtained the highest number of votes for the position of Senator of the Republic of the Philippines.
 4. Protestee de Lima garnered 14,144,070 votes as against Protestant Tolentino's 12,811,098 votes.
 5. Protestee de Lima had a lead advantage of 1,332,972 votes.
- B. Documents the Authenticity and Due Execution of which are Admitted by the Parties:
1. Certificates of Candidacy of Protestant Tolentino and Protestee de Lima (Annexes "A" to "A-5", Amended Election Protest)
 2. COMELEC-NBOC Resolution No. 007-16 dated 19 May 2016 (Annexes "C" to "C-2", Amended Election Protest)
 3. Senatorial Canvass Report (By Rank) as of 19 May 2016 (Annexes "D" to "D-3", Amended Election Protest)
- C. Provisions of Law Admitted by Protestant Tolentino but Not the Interpretation Given by Protestee de Lima:
1. R.A. No. 8436, as amended by R.A. 9639
 2. Section 2, Article IX (c) of the 1987 Constitution

II. STIPULATION OF FACTS AND DOCUMENTS

- A. Proposed by Protestant Tolentino and Admitted by Protestee de Lima:

1. COMELEC has not conducted a forensic audit of the effect of the change in the script made by Mr. Garcia to the AES.
2. The non-recording of protests in precincts in the Minutes of Testing and Sealing, Voting and Counting of Votes ("MOVs") does not preclude the filing of an election protest before the Honorable Tribunal.

B. Proposed by Protestee de Lima and Admitted by Protestant Tolentino:

1. COMELEC, in compliance with Sec. 19 of R.A. No. 9369, which amended Sec. 18 of R.A. No. 8436 has set up a Transparency Server at the Pope Pius XII Catholic Center Building to receive electronically transmitted precinct results and disseminate the same to the respective levels of board of canvassers, to the Liberal Party (LP) as the dominant majority, to the Parish Pastoral Council for Responsible Voting (PPCRV) as the accredited citizen's arm to conduct an unofficial count and to the *Kapisanan ng mga Brodkaster ng Pilipinas* (KBP).
2. That in Comelec Resolution No. 10105A promulgated on 05 May 2016, the Commission on Elections, in the interest of promoting transparency, approved the requests of certain media organizations for access to the same election result data from a mirror or redundancy server ("MS"). The MS end users were Rappler, Inc., GMA Network, Inc. and the Philippine Daily Inquirer.

C. Proposed by Protestee de Lima and Admitted by Protestant Tolentino as Part of the Records:

1. Complying with the Tribunal's Notice of Resolution No. 16-01, Protestee de Lima filed her Verified Answer on 27 July 2016. On the same day, Protestant Tolentino filed his Motion for Leave to File and to Admit Amended Election Protest but only served a copy of the same to Protestee de Lima on 29 July 2016.

2. In Resolution No. 16-04 dated 28 July 2016, the Honorable Tribunal granted Protestant Tolentino's Motion and required Protestee de Lima to file her Answer to the Amended Election Protest within ten (10) days from service. The Resolution was issued prior to Protestee de Lima's filing of a Comment/Opposition to Protestant Tolentino's Motion on 02 August 2016.
 3. Protestant Tolentino's total cash deposit made, as of the filing of the Preliminary Conference Brief by counsel for Protestee de Lima, is Two Hundred Thousand Pesos (P200,000.00).
- D. Proposed by Protestee de Lima and Admitted by Protestant Tolentino, subject to the Outcome of the Protest:
1. That the electronically transmitted precincts results nationwide were made available to the public through the Transparency and the Mirror Servers.
 2. Pursuant to Comelec Resolution No. 10111 promulgated on 03 May 2016, as amended, the canvass/consolidation of votes for the election of senators and party-list representatives in the 09 May 2016 National and Local Elections by the Comelec-NBOC continued from day to day until completed and that said canvass was open and public.
 3. Comelec-NBOC proclaimed all twelve (12) senators after determining that the remaining uncanvassed 1,211 votes can no longer materially affect Protestee de Lima's lead of 1,332,972 votes over Protestant Tolentino. The 1,211 votes consist of: 321 votes from Brgy. Lumbaca Ingud, Masiu, Lanao del Sur; 268 votes from Brgy. Mabuyong, Anini-y, Antique; 34 votes from Brgy. Insubuan, San Remegio, Antique; 119 votes from Brgy. San Francisco, Lope de Vega, Northern Samar; and 469 votes from detainee voting.

4. Pursuant to Sec. 24 of R.A. No. 9369 in relation to Comelec Resolutions Nos. 10078, 10090 and 10109, Comelec conducted a Random Manual Audit of randomly selected clustered precincts to determine whether the automated count of the Vote Counting Machines (VCMs) under an Automated Election System (AES) is accurate based on a manual verification of said count. For purposes of the 2016 NLE, the Commission has increased the number of RMA precincts to 715 in order to make the sample more proportionate to the number of clustered precincts per legislative district.

III. ADMISSION OF THE EXISTENCE, AUTHENTICITY AND DUE EXECUTION OF DOCUMENTS

A. Requested by Protestee de Lima and Admitted by Protestant Tolentino:

1. Certificates of Candidacy of Protestee de Lima and Protestant Tolentino (Annexes "1" and "2", Verified Answer)

B. Requested by Protestee de Lima and Admitted by Protestant Tolentino, subject to the Outcome of the Protest:

1. National Canvass Report No. 1 (Annex "3", Amended Answer)
2. National Canvass Report No. 2 (Annex "4", Amended Answer)
3. National Tally Sheet Consolidated Audit Report on Overseas Voting (CAROV) (42 posts including Taiwan and Israel) and Local Absentee Voting (Manual Elections) (Annex "5", Verified Answer)
4. National Canvass Report No. 3 (Annex "6", Verified Answer)

5. Senatorial National Canvass Report (by Rank) dated 19 May 2016
(Annex "8", Verified Answer)
 6. Comelec-NBOC Resolution No. 007-16 dated 19 May 2016
(Annex "9", Verified Answer)
 7. Minutes of Testing and Sealing, Voting and Counting of Votes ("MOVs") from the 16 clustered precincts that functioned in the entire Municipality of Al-Barka, Basilan
(Annexes "11" to "11-O", Verified Answer)
 8. Statement of Votes by Precinct ("SOVPs")
(Annexes "12" to "12-X" and Annexes "13" to "13-G", Verified Answer)
 9. Certificates of Canvass ("COCs") from CBOC-Asia, CBOC-Middle East and Africas and CBOC-Europe
(Annexes "12-Y" to "12-K", Verified Answer)
- C. Requested by Protestee de Lima and Admitted by Protestant Tolentino as Part of the Records:
1. Protestant Tolentino's Petition (With Urgent Prayer for Issuance of TRO) filed before the Supreme Court entitled "Francis N. Tolentino versus Commission on Elections, Sherwin Gatchalian, Ralph Recto, Leila de Lima" docketed as G.R. No. 224329
(Annex "7", Verified Answer)
 2. Supreme Court Resolution dated 31 May 2016 in G.R. No 224329 (Francis N. Tolentino versus Commission on Elections, Sherwin Gatchalian, Ralph Recto, Leila de Lima)
(Annex "10", Verified Answer)

IV. ISSUES INVOLVED

A. Issues raised by the Parties:

1. WHETHER OR NOT THE HONORABLE SENATE ELECTORAL TRIBUNAL SHOULD FIRST ORDER A FORENSIC AUDIT OF THE AUTOMATED ELECTION SYSTEM (AES) BEFORE PROCEEDING WITH THE PRESENTATION OF EVIDENCE AND REVISION/ CORRECTION OF BALLOTS.

(Both parties agreed to submit the issue for ruling after the Tribunal has completed the revision of pilot precincts.)

2. WHETHER OR NOT THE PURPORTED SENATORIAL RESULTS IN THE PROTESTED AREAS/PRECINCTS ARE FRAUDULENT, MANUFACTURED, PADDED, ALTERED AND DISTORTED VOTE TOTAL, WHICH DO NOT REFLECT THE TRUE NUMBER OF VOTES CAST BY THE ELECTORATE IN THE PROTESTED AREAS/PRECINCTS.

(Both parties agreed to proceed with the revision.)

3. WHETHER OR NOT THERE WAS PRE-SHADING OF BALLOTS IN THE PROTESTED PRECINCTS IN NEGROS OCCIDENTAL AND BASILAN, WHICH RESULTED IN FRAUDULENT AND MANUFACTURED VOTING RESULTS, THUS NECESSITATING THE ANNULMENT OF THE ELECTION RESULTS THEREIN.

4. WHETHER OR NOT THE VOTING RESULTS IN THE PROTESTED PRECINCTS WITH AN IMPOSSIBLE AND IMPROBABLE TURNOUT OF 100% OF THE REGISTERED VOTERS ARE MANUFACTURED, THUS NECESSITATING THE ANNULMENT OF THE ELECTION RESULTS THEREIN.

B. Legal Issues:

1. WHETHER OR NOT PROTESTANT TOLENTINO'S ELECTION PROTEST SHOULD BE DISMISSED OUTRIGHT FOR BEING INSUFFICIENT IN FORM AND SUBSTANCE, FOR PROTESTANT

TOLENTINO'S FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH THE REQUIREMENTS OF RULE 22 IN RELATION TO RULE 23 OF THE 2013 RULES OF THE SENATE ELECTORAL TRIBUNAL, WHICH AMOUNTS TO A FAILURE TO STATE A CAUSE OF ACTION.

2. WHETHER OR NOT THE HONORABLE TRIBUNAL LACKS JURISDICTION TO CONDUCT A "FORENSIC AUDIT" OF CERTAIN ELECTION PRECINCT RESULTS AND TO ANNUL SAID CORRESPONDING PRECINCTS RESULTS BASED ONLY ON PROTESTANT TOLENTINO'S ALLEGATIONS AND ABSENT A REVIEW OF THE OFFICIAL BALLOTS AND OTHER PERTINENT ELECTION DOCUMENTS AND PARAPHERNALIA.

V. DOCUMENTARY EVIDENCE

- A. Protestant Tolentino will SUBMIT the following documentary evidence, viz:

	DOCUMENT	PURPOSE
1	Certificates of Canvass and Statements of Votes of the Protested Precincts*	To prove, among others, the purported results of the 2016 Automated NLE in the affected protested precincts, which are sham, fraudulent, manufactured, altered and distorted, and not reflective of the true results of the elections.
2	Project of Precincts for 2016 Automated NLE**	To prove, among others, the precincts covered by the 8-digit clustered precinct numbers used by Protestant Tolentino in his Amended Election Protest, and to prove the specific precincts which were merged/clustered and which functioned during the 09 May 2016 Automated NLE.
3	Election Day Computerized Voters List (EDCVL) used in the 2016 Automated NLE	To prove, among others, the number of registered voters in the protested precincts and the number of voters who actually voted or did not vote.
4	Forensic Audit Report	To prove, among others, the results of the forensic audit on the 2016 Automated NLE, and that the election results during the 2016 Automated NLE are not reflective of the ballots cast therein.

* Admitted by Protestee de Lima, subject to the results of revision

** Admitted by Protestee de Lima, subject to the outcome of the protest

During the scheduled preliminary conference, counsel for Protestant Tolentino requested that Protestant Tolentino be allowed to submit a list of additional evidence to supplement his Preliminary Conference Brief, which was prepared by his former counsel. The Tribunal, in open session, GRANTED the request. Counsel for Protestant Tolentino was directed to submit the list of additional evidence, copy furnished counsel for Protestee de Lima, who was given five (5) days from receipt of said pleading to file a *Comment* thereon.

Thus, on 20 February 2017, Protestant Tolentino filed his Compliance dated 16 February 2017 and manifested that the following shall serve as his additional evidence, to wit:

	DOCUMENT	PURPOSE ¹
1	Affidavit dated 17 June 2016 of Mama Kamal Subpangan	<u>To prove, among others, that: (a) the 2016 National and Local elections (the "2016 NLE") generated an impossible one hundred percent (100%) voter turnout in the protested precincts specified in the "Amended Protest" dated 27 July 2016 (the "Amended Protest"); (b) despite the affiants having casted their votes in favor of protestant, the 2016 NLE resulted in zero votes for protestant in the protested precincts; (c) the election results in affected protested precincts are not reflective of the ballots cast therein; and (d) protestant, and not protestee, should have been proclaimed as the 12th winning senatorial candidate during the 2016 NLE.</u>
2	Affidavit dated 17 June 2016 of Pendatun A. Subpangan	
3	Affidavit dated 17 June 2016 of Ad'k Pulis Macasalang	<u>To prove, among others, that (a) despite the affiants having cast votes in favor of protestant, the 2016 NLE resulted in zero votes for protestant in the protested precincts; (b) the election</u>
4	Affidavit dated 17 June 2016 of Saed Malacao Tabunaway	

¹ Protestant Tolentino's *Manifestation* dated 01 March 2017.

5	Affidavit dated 17 June 2016 of Basit Mama Madag	<u>results in affected protested precincts are not reflective of the ballots cast therein; and (c) protestant, and not protestee, should have been proclaimed as the 12th winning senatorial candidate during the 2016 NLE.</u>
6	Affidavit dated 25 September 2016 of Lydia D. Espiritu	
7	Affidavit dated 25 September 2016 of Charlie S. Romeo	
8	Affidavit dated 25 September 2016 of David C. Bactad	
9	Affidavit dated 25 September 2016 of Remedios N. Sinobago	
10	Affidavit dated 25 September 2016 of Arnel Remorin	
11	Affidavit dated 25 September 2016 of Ruben S. Caspe	
12	Affidavit dated 24 September 2016 of Marion P. Palay, Jr.	
13	Affidavit dated 25 September 2016 of Maricel A. Miana	
14	Affidavit dated 24 September 2016 of Geoffrey Obando	
15	Affidavit dated 25 September 2016 of Marion M. Palay, Sr.	
16	Affidavit dated 25 September 2016 of Nestor Nucasa	
17	Affidavit dated 25 September 2016 of Eduardo A. Miana	
18	Affidavit dated 25 September 2016 of Ernesto Molina	
19	Affidavit dated 25 September 2016 of Romeo Dela Rosa Itorma	

20	Affidavit dated 26 September 2016 of Renato B. Magat	
21	Affidavit dated 27 September 2016 of Ronnie D. Catacutan	
22	Affidavit dated 27 September 2016 Roldan B. Roque, Jr.	
23	Affidavit dated 27 September 2016 of Arsenio Villareal	
24	Affidavit of Meric Mara	<p><u>To prove, among others, that the election results concerning protestant and protestee are sham, false, manufactured, and fraudulent and not reflective of the true votes cast because of the tampering, manipulation, and bypass of the Automated Election System (AES).</u></p>
25	Affidavit of Felix P. Muga II	
26	Affidavit of Ma. Corazon M. Akol	
27	Affidavit of Beatrice G. Quimson	
28	Certificates of Canvass of the protested precincts listed in the "Amended Protest" dated 27 July 2016 (the Protested Precincts)*	<p><u>To prove, among others, that: (a) the 2016 NLE generated an impossible 100% voter turnout in the protested precincts; and (b) the election results in the affected protested precincts are not reflective of the ballots cast therein.</u></p> <p><u>*To prove, among others, the purported results of the 2016 automated NLE in the affected protested precincts, which are sham, fraudulent, manufactured, altered and distorted, and not reflective of the true results of the elections.²</u></p>
29	Statements of Votes of the Protested Precincts	<p><u>To prove, among others, that: (a) the 2016 NLE generated an impossible 100% voter turnout in the protested precincts; and (b) the election results in the affected protested precincts are not reflective of the ballots cast therein</u></p>

²From Comment /To Resolution No. 16-38 dated 2 March 2017 and Motion of Protestant Tolentino, p. 2.

30	Project of Precincts for the 2016 Automated National and Local Elections	<p><u>To prove, among others, that: (a) the 2016 NLE generated an impossible 100% voter turnout in the protested precincts; and (b) the election results in the affected protested precincts are not reflective of the ballots cast therein.</u></p> <p><u>*To prove, among others, the precincts covered by the 8-digit clustered precinct numbers used by Protestant Tolentino in his Amended Election Protest, and to prove the specific precincts which were merged/clustered and which functioned during the 09 May 2016 Automated NLE.³</u></p>
31	Election day Computerized Voters List (EDCVL) used in the 2016 Automated NLE	<p><u>To prove, among others, that: (a) the 2016 NLE generated an impossible 100% voter turnout in the protested precincts; and (b) the election results in the affected protested precincts are not reflective of the ballots cast therein.</u></p> <p><u>*To prove, among others, the number of registered voters in the protested precincts and the number of voters who actually voted or did not vote.⁴</u></p>
32	Report of William Yu, Information Technology Director of the Parish Pastoral Council for Responsible Voting dated 11 May 2016	<p><u>To prove, among others, that the election results concerning protestant and protestee are sham, false, manufactured, and fraudulent and not reflective of the true votes cast because of the tampering, manipulation, and bypass of AES.</u></p>
33	Affidavit of William Yu	<p><u>To prove, among others, that the election results concerning protestant and protestee are sham, false, manufactured, and fraudulent and not reflective of the true votes cast</u></p>

³ *Ibid.*

⁴ *Ibid.*

		<u>because of the tampering, manipulation, and bypass of the AES.</u>
34	Affidavit of Rouie Peñalba	<u>To prove, among others, that: (a) there was a breach in the Commission on Elections' (COMELEC) transparency server during the 2016 NLE; (b) Marlon Garcia of Smartmatic Philippines, Inc. introduced changes in the script in the AES; and (c) identify and authenticate based on record the Project of Precincts, Provincial / Municipal / City Certificates of Canvass, statement of votes by precincts, Statement of Votes by Municipality, and other pertinent documents.</u>
35	Urgent Memorandum of COMELEC Information Technology Officer II Rouie Peñalba	<u>To prove, among others, that the election results concerning protestant and protestee are sham, false, manufactured, and fraudulent and not reflective of the true votes cast</u>
36	National Citizens' Movement for Free Elections Systems Group Report	<u>because of the tampering, manipulation and bypass of the AES.</u>
37	Matrix of 2016 Automated Election System	
38	Forensic Audit Report	<u>To prove, among others, that the election results concerning protestant and protestee are sham, false, manufactured, and fraudulent and not reflective of the true votes cast because of the tampering, manipulation and bypass of the AES.</u> <u>*To prove, among others, the results of the forensic audit on the 2016 Automated NLE, and that the election results during the 2016 Automated NLE are not reflective of the ballots cast therein.⁵</u>

⁵ *Ibid.*

39	Ballots subject to revision	<u>To prove, among others, that: (a) ballots were pre-shaded in the protested precincts, which resulted in sham, false, manufactured, and altered votes; and (b) the election results concerning protestant and protestee are sham, false, manufactured, and fraudulent and not reflective of the true votes cast because of the tampering, manipulation and bypass of the AES.</u>
40	Electronic images of ballots as stored in secure digital (SD) cards of the forty-five (45) vote counting machines (the "VCMs") under the Commission on Election's protective custody	
41	Systems logs of the Municipal Board of Canvasser's servers and the Commission on Elections' (COMELEC) central and transparency servers	
42	System logs of the vote counting machines and/or SD cards	
43	System logs of the Domain Network Server used by the COMELEC during the 2016 elections to decrypt the encrypted data coming from the VCMs	
44	Other data obtained from the SD cards of the VCMs under the COMELEC's protective custody	
45	VCMs under the COMELEC's protective custody	
46	The COMELEC's random manual audit	<u>To prove, among others, that: (a) the 2016 NLE generated an impossible 100% voter turnout in the protested precincts; (b) the election results in the affected protested precincts are not reflective of the ballots cast therein.</u>
47	Voters Verification Paper Audit Trail obtained from the protested precincts	

Protestant Tolentino will present the testimonies of the following witnesses:

	WITNESS	PURPOSE
1	Registered voters in the protested precincts which reported a 100% voter turnout during the 2016 Automated National and Local Elections <i>(3 witnesses per clustered precinct)</i>	To testify on the fact that they did not cast their votes during the 09 May 2016 Automated NLE in the precincts where they are registered, and yet the protested precincts reported a 100% voter turnout; to testify on the fact that when the said voters went to their concerned precincts, they found out that their respective ballots were already cast; and to prove that the election results in the affected protested precincts are not reflective of the ballots cast therein.
2	Registered voters in the protested precincts where votes for Protestant Tolentino were not counted <i>(3 witnesses)</i>	To testify on the fact that despite having cast their vote in favor of Protestant Tolentino, the protested precincts resulted in zero votes for Protestant Tolentino; and to prove that the election results in the affected protested precincts are not reflective of the ballots cast therein.
3	Registered voters and watchers in the affected precincts where pre-shading occurred. <i>(not more than 3 witnesses)</i>	To testify on the fact of pre-shading in the protested precincts which resulted in sham, false, manufactured, and altered voting results; to testify on their personal account of the segregation and examination of pre-shaded ballots by members of the respective BEIs in the affected protested precincts; and to prove that the election results in the affected protested precincts are not reflective of the ballots cast therein.
4	Witnesses who will testify on the transmitted results in the protested precincts <i>(7 witnesses)</i>	To prove that the results are sham, false, manufactured, and fraudulent and not reflective of the true votes cast considering the tampering, manipulation and bypass of AES.

5	<p>A Representative from the COMELEC Information Technology Department</p> <p><i>(4 or 5 witnesses from COMELEC)</i></p>	<p>To identify and validate the 8-digit clustered precinct numbers used by Protestant Tolentino in his Amended Election Protest, and to identify and validate the individual precincts making up each clustered precinct.</p>
6	<p>Witnesses who will testify on the financial means of Protestee de Lima</p> <p><i>(2 witnesses)</i></p>	<p>To prove that contrary to her claims, she has the necessary financial means and connections to benefit from the electoral fraud which occurred during the 2016 Automated NLE.</p>
7	<p>COMELEC Representatives from the ERSD and/or COMELEC office</p> <p><i>(covered by 7 witnesses in number 4)</i></p>	<p>To identify and authenticate based on record the Project of Precincts, Provincial/Municipal/City Certificates of Canvass, Statement of Votes by Precincts (SOVP), Statement of Votes by Municipality (SOVM) and other pertinent documents.</p>
8	<p>IT Expert/Forensic Auditor</p> <p><i>(covered by 7 witnesses in number 4)</i></p>	<p>To testify on the results of his forensic audit of the 2016 AES and to prove that the election results in the affected protested precincts are not reflective of the ballots cast therein.</p>

B. Protestee de Lima will SUBMIT the following documentary evidence:

	DOCUMENT	PURPOSE
1	<p>Provincial/Municipal/City Certificates of Canvass</p>	<p>As proof of the correct base figures, nationwide on a per province, municipality or city basis from which valid claimed votes shall be added in the determination of the parties' gains or losses, as the case may be vis-à-vis the national figures, based on the results of revision and appreciation of ballots in the revised protested precincts. As further proof that the results were officially canvassed by the corresponding Board of Canvassers.</p>

2	Printed General Election Returns (ERs)	As proof of the parties' votes prior to revision and as possible secondary evidence.
3	Statement of Votes by Municipality (SOVMs) and Statement of Votes by Precinct (SOVPs)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> (1) As proof of the pre-recount votes in the protested precincts; (2) As comparative references for analysis of reasonable recovery of votes after recount/revision in the protested precincts; and (3) As reference for comparative analysis of the votes on the issue of gains or losses, as the case may be, in the recount/revision results vis-à-vis the issue of recovery of votes, over-all i.e., the comparison of the votes per the Statement of Votes by Precinct, Election Returns and per physical count of ballots during revision.
4	Voters Receipt	As proof that the vote cast is faithfully recorded by the VCMs as verified by the voter.
5	Recount/Revision Reports covering the recount of ballots in the contested precincts, and possibly, photocopies of objected and claimed ballots.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> (1) As proof of the parties' votes per generated election return and per physical count of the ballots; (2) As proof of the parties' objections and claims to ballots as revised; (3) As primary evidence of the absence of ballot-related frauds and anomalies pleaded in the protest; (4) As repository of other significant findings or observations uncovered during recount/revision, and (5) As source of material data for analysis in the over-all evaluation of ballots and evidence.
6	Minutes of Testing and Sealing and Voting and Counting of Votes from the protested precincts***	(1) As source and reference of certain material data such as number of registered voters, voters who actually voted, number of

		<p>issued/used and unused ballots, serial number of data storage devices (both the main memory card and the backup memory card); and</p> <p>(2) As primary reference of the data on voting of illiterate/disabled voters thru assistants.</p>
7	2016 Project of Precincts and Statistical Data Reports ***	<p>(1) As proof of the number of precincts, as established and as merged/clustered, which functioned during the 09 May 2016 Automated NLE;</p> <p>(2) As further proof of the data on the number of registered voters and who actually voted in the protested precincts; and</p> <p>(3) As guide in the identification of precincts, merged/clustered, for purposes of recount/revision and other proceedings as appreciation of ballots.</p>
8	Technical Examination Reports, if and when technical examination is required and conducted as may be warranted from the recount/revision results and findings. ***	As proof of the findings and results of the technical examination, if and when so conducted depending on the results of recount/revision.
9	Audit Log Reports from the protested clustered precincts. ***	(1) As repository of all activities performed by the Vote Counting Machines ("VCM") in the protested clustered/merged precincts from the time that it was powered on until the time the VCMs were closed.
10	Data Storage Devices [Main and Back up] ***	(1) As proof of the data used to configure a particular VCM machine as it was designed to read a specific ballot image that is unique to specific precincts;

		<p>(2) As proof of the images of the ballot scanned and counted on election day; and</p> <p>(3) As proof of the true election results in the protested precinct vis-à-vis the generated election returns and of the audit log reports for the protested precincts.</p>
11	Election Day Computerized Voters List (EDCVL) used in the 2016 Automated National and Local Elections	As repository of the Number of Voters who Actually Voted and their corresponding Signatures and the determination of whether legitimate, real and actual voters voted or others voted for them and in their stead.
12	Random Manual Audit Report relative to the conduct of the 2016 Automated National and Local Elections. ***	As proof of the accuracy of the 2016 National and Local Elections.

*** Protestant admitted its existence but subject to the outcome of the protest.

and PRESENT the testimonies of the following witnesses:

	WITNESS	PURPOSE
1	<p>Chairpersons of the Board of Election Inspectors (BEIs) of selected precincts, depending on the results of the recount/revision and especially where such recount/revision yields significant findings and/or finding of tampering and/or substitution of ballots, post election or otherwise</p> <p><i>(not more than 3 witnesses)</i></p>	The exact nature and substance of their testimonies will depend on the results of revision of ballots and election documents.
2	Technical experts from the COMELEC, National Printing Office and	As proof of possible substitution or tampering of ballots, and of the data or images of the ballot stored in the data

<p>Smartmatic to testify on the results of technical examination, if and when requested by Protestee de Lima, and authorized by the Honorable Tribunal, depending on the results of recount/revision, such as, but not limited to, findings of substitution or tampering of ballots, the data storage devices, and the electronically transmitted election results, post-election or otherwise.</p> <p><i>(not more than 3 witnesses per office)</i></p>	<p>storage devices [administrator and/or poll worker memory cards], post-election or otherwise, as may be uncovered in the course of recount/revision.</p>
----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

D. Common Exhibits of the Parties which will be Offered for Different Purpose/s:

	DOCUMENT	PURPOSE
1	Election Day Computerized Voters List (EDCVL) used in the 2016 Automated NLE.	Different purpose/s
2	Provincial/Municipal/City Certificates of Canvass.	Different purpose/s
3	Printed General Election Returns (ERs).	Different purpose/s
4	Statement of Votes by Municipality (SOVMs) and Statement of Votes by Precinct (SOVPs).	Different purpose/s
5	Election Day Computerized Voters List (EDCVL) used in the 2016 Automated National and Local Elections.	Different purpose/s

VI. PILOT PRECINCTS

- A. The Pilot Precincts designated by Protestant Tolentino are listed in Annex "A" which is made an integral part hereof.

VII. SCHEDULES

The Canvass Board Service and Legal Service shall prepare a new schedule of proceedings within ten (10) days from receipt of this Resolution and shall submit the same for the approval of the Executive Committee. Thereupon, copies of the approved schedule of proceedings shall be served upon the parties for their information and guidance.

Copies of this Resolution shall be furnished the parties, through their respective counsel, who are each given a period of **three (3) days** from receipt thereof within which to submit any comment, which shall be restricted solely to whether or not this Resolution faithfully reflects the admissions and stipulations of the parties. The parties and their respective counsel cannot add any new matter with respect to the issues agreed upon and the evidence to be presented.

The parties are hereby INFORMED that consistent with the purpose of a preliminary conference, i.e., to limit the number of witnesses and the amount of evidence, as well as to aid in the prompt disposition of the case, the presentation of any other evidence will not be allowed unless a motion for their inclusion is filed with and approved by the Tribunal.

The contents of this Resolution shall control the subsequent course of the proceedings.

WHEREFORE, the parties, through their counsel, are given **three (3) days** from receipt of this Resolution to submit any comment, which shall be restricted solely to whether or not this Resolution faithfully reflects the admissions and stipulations of the parties. The parties and their respective counsel cannot

add any new matter with respect to the issues agreed upon and the evidence to be presented.

SO ORDERED.

09 May 2017.



ANTONIO T. CARPIO
Senior Associate Justice
Chairperson



TERESITA J. LEONARDO-DE CASTRO
Associate Justice
Member



LUCAS P. BERSAMIN
Associate Justice
Member

CYNTHIA A. VILLAR
Senator
Member

GRACE L. POE
Senator
Member



MA. LOURDES "NANCY" S. BINAY
Senator
Member

RICHARD J. GORDON
Senator
Member



FRANKLIN M. DRILON
Senator
Member

ANTONIO "SONNY" F. TRILLANES IV
Senator
Member

SET Case 001-16 (Tolentino vs. De Lima)
Pilot Precincts for Revision

PROVINCE	CITY / MUNICIPALITY	No. of Contested Clustered Precincts	Clustered Precinct Number	Clustered / Grouped Precincts
TAWI-TAWI	Panglima Sugala (Balimbing)	1	18	43A, 44A, 44B
	Turtle Islands	1	4	8A, 8B
SULU	Lugus	1	20	46A, 46B, 46C, 46D
	Luuk	1	19	39A, 39B, 40A, 40B
	Maimbung	2	25	32A, 33A, 34A, 35A, 36A, 37A
			27	39A, 40A, 41A
	Panglima Estino (New Panamao)	1	14	55A, 56A, 57A, 58A, 59A, 60A
	Pata	7	4	11A, 12A
			5	13A, 14A
			6	15A, 16A, 17A
			7	18A, 19A, 20A, 21A, 22A
			9	29A, 30A
			11	35A, 36A
	Tongkil	3	15	50A, 51A, 52A
			15	44A, 45A, 46A, 47A
18			56A, 56B, 57A, 58A, 59A	
BASILAN	Isabela City	1	109	213C, 213D, 213P1
	Tuburan	1	8	46A, 47A
BASILAN	Al Barka	3	4	33A, 33B, 34A, 35A, 35P1
			6	63A, 64A, 64B, 65A, 65P1
			35	117A, 118A, 119A, 119P1
	Sumisip	4	1	1A, 2A, 2B
			2	3A, 4A
			17	38A, 39A, 40A, 41A, 41B, 41C
			32	74A, 75A, 76A, 77A, 77B
Tabuan-Lasa	2	13	23A, 23B, 24A, 25A, 25B	
		19	35A, 35B, 36A	
MAGUINDANAO	Datu Odin Sinsuat (Dinaig)	4	9	32A, 32B, 33A
			10	33B, 34A
			24	70A, 70B, 71A
			25	72A, 73A, 73B
	Matanog	1	1	1A, 1B, 2A, 2B
	Pagagawan	1	7	32A, 33A, 34A, 35A, 36A, 37A
Parang	2	22	49A, 50A, 51A, 51B	
		26	57A, 57B	
LANAO DEL SUR	Ganassi	2	15	19A, 20A
			16	21A, 21B
	Butig	1	11	23A, 24A, 25A, 25B
	Maguing	4	14	24A, 24B
			18	28A, 28B, 28C, 28D
			30	42A, 42B
			32	44A, 45A

PROVINCE	CITY / MUNICIPALITY	No. of Contested Clustered Precincts	Clustered Precinct Number	Clustered / Grouped Precincts
LANAO DEL SUR	Picong (Sultan Gumander)	1	2	2A, 2B, 2C, 2D
	Binidayan	1	16	24A
LANAO DEL NORTE	Sultan Naga Dimaporo (Karomatan)	2	6	24A, 25A, 26A, 26P, 26P1
			51	167A, 168A, 169A, 170A, 170P1
	Pantao Ragat	4	6	13A, 13B, 14A
			13	29A, 29B, 30A, 31A
			17	39A, 40A, 40B, 40C
	19	43A, 43B, 44A, 44B		
NORTH COTABATO	Pikit	1	65	161A, 161B, 162A, 162B, 163A, 163B
CEBU	Cordoba	12	1	1A, 2A, 3A, 3B
			2	4A, 4B, 5A, 6A
			3	7A, 8A, 9A, 9B
			4	10A, 11A, 12A, 12B
			5	13A, 14A, 15A, 15B
			6	16A, 17A, 18A, 19A
			7	19B, 20A, 20B
			8	21A, 22A, 22B
			9	23A, 25A, 25B
			10	24A, 26A, 26B, 27A
			11	28A, 29A, 29B
			12	30A, 30B, 30C, 35A
	Cebu City	11	6	15A, 15B, 16A
			7	17A, 18A, 19A
			8	20A, 20B, 21A, 22A
			9	23A, 24A, 25A, 26A, 26P1
			10	27A, 27B, 28A, 29A
			11	29B, 30A, 30B, 31A
			12	31B, 32A, 33A, 33B
			13	34A, 34B, 35A, 35B
	Argao	7	14	36A, 36B, 37A, 37B
			15	38A, 38B, 39A, 39B
			16	40A, 40B, 41A, 41B
			1	1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A, 6A
			2	7A, 8A, 9A, 10A, 11A
			3	12A, 13A, 14A, 15A, 17A, 22A
			4	16A, 18A, 19A, 20A, 21A, 23A
	Tuburan	21	5	24A, 25A, 26A, 27A, 28A
			6	29A, 30A, 31A
			7	32A, 33A, 34A, 35A
			1	1A, 1B, 5A, 5B
			2	2A, 3A, 3B, 4A, 4B
			3	6A, 6B, 7A, 7B
			4	8A, 8B, 9A, 10A
			5	11A, 11B, 12A
			6	13A, 14A
	7	15A, 15B, 16A, 16B, 17A, 17B		
	8	18A, 18B, 20A, 20B, 20C		
	9	19A, 19B, 21A, 21B		

PROVINCE	CITY / MUNICIPALITY	No. of Contested Clustered Precincts	Clustered Precinct Number	Clustered / Grouped Precincts	
CEBU	Tuburan (cont'd)		10	22A, 22B, 23A	
			11	24A, 24B, 24C	
			12	25A, 25B, 26A, 26B, 29A, 29B	
			13	27A, 27B, 27C, 28A	
			14	30A, 30B, 31A, 32A, 32B	
			15	33A, 33B, 34A, 34B	
			16	35A, 35B, 36A, 36B, 37A, 37B	
			17	38A, 38B, 41A, 41B	
			18	39A, 39B, 40A	
			19	42A, 42B, 42C, 44A	
			20	43A, 43B, 45A, 45B	
			21	46A, 46B, 47A, 47B	
WESTERN SAMAR	Basey	15	1	1A, 1B, 2A	
			2	3A, 4A, 4B	
			3	5A, 5B, 6A, 7A	
			4	8A, 8B	
			5	9A, 9B, 10A, 11A	
			6	12A, 13A	
			7	14A	
			8	15A, 16A, 16B, 17A	
			9	18A, 18B, 19A, 20A	
			10	21A, 21B	
			11	22A, 22B, 23A	
			12	24A, 24B, 25A, 26A	
			13	27A, 28A, 29A	
			14	30A, 31A, 32A, 32B	
			15	33A, 33B	
		Catbalogan	23	1	1A, 2A, 3A
	2			3B, 4A, 4B, 4C	
	3			5A, 6A, 6B, 6C	
	4			7A, 7B, 8B, 9B	
	5			8A, 9A, 10A	
	6			10B, 11A, 11B, 11C	
	7			12A, 15A, 16B, 16C	
	8			13A, 14A, 16A	
	9			17A, 17B, 18A, 18B	
	10			19A, 20A, 21A	
	11			22A, 22B, 22C, 22D	
	12			23A, 24A	
	13			24B, 25A, 26A	
	14	27A, 27B			
	15	28A, 29A, 29B			
	16	30A, 31A, 31B, 32A			
	17	32B, 33A, 33B, 34A, 34B			
	18	35A, 36A, 39B			
	19	36B, 37A, 38A, 39A			
	20	40A, 43A			
	21	40B, 41A, 42A			
	22	44A, 44B, 45A, 45B, 46A, 46B			
	23	47A, 47B, 48A, 51A			

PROVINCE	CITY / MUNICIPALITY	No. of Contested Clustered Precincts	Clustered Precinct Number	Clustered / Grouped Precincts
WESTERN SAMAR	San Jose de Buan	9	1	1A, 1B, 1C
			2	2A, 2B, 2C
			3	3A, 3B, 3C
			4	4A, 4B
			5	5A, 5B, 5C
			6	6A, 6B, 6C
			7	7A, 7B
			8	8A, 8B
			9	9A, 9B
	Santa Margarita	14	1	1A, 1B, 2A, 2B
			2	3A, 3B, 4A, 4B, 5A, 5B
			3	6A, 6B, 7A, 7B
			4	8A, 8B, 9A, 9B
			5	10A, 10B, 11A, 11B
			6	12A, 12B, 13A, 13B
			7	14A, 14B
			8	15A, 15B
			9	16A, 16B
			10	17A, 17B
			11	18A, 18B, 19A, 19B
			12	20A, 20B, 21A, 21B
			13	22A, 22B
			14	23A, 23B
	San Jorge	15	1	1A, 1B, 1C
			2	2A, 2B, 2C
			3	3A, 3B, 3C, 3D
			4	4A, 4B
			5	5A, 5B, 5C
			6	6A, 6B
			7	7A, 7B, 7C, 7D
			8	8A, 8B, 8C
			9	9A, 9B
			10	10A, 10B
			11	11A, 11B
			12	12A, 12B
			13	13A, 13B
			14	14A, 14B
			15	15A, 15B
	Calbayog City	18	1	1A, 1B, 2A, 3A
			2	3B, 4A, 4B, 4C
			3	5A, 6A, 6B
			4	7A, 7B, 8A, 8B
			5	9A, 10A, 10B, 10C
			6	10D, 11A, 11B, 11C, 11D
			7	12A, 12B, 13A, 13B
			8	14A, 14B, 15A, 15B
9			16A, 16B, 17A, 17B	
10			18A, 18B, 19A, 19B	
11			20A, 20B, 20C, 21A	

PROVINCE	CITY / MUNICIPALITY	No. of Contested Clustered Precincts	Clustered Precinct Number	Clustered / Grouped Precincts
WESTERN SAMAR	Calbayog City (cont'd)		12	21B, 22A, 22B, 22C
			13	23A, 23B, 23C
			14	24A, 24B
			15	25A, 26A, 26B
			16	27A, 27B
			17	28A, 28B, 28C
			18	29A, 30A, 31A
ZAMBOANGA DEL NORTE	Dipolog City	33	1	1A, 2A, 2B, 3A, 3B
			2	4A, 4B, 5A, 5B, 6A
			3	6B, 7A, 8A, 8B, 9A, 9B
			4	10A, 11A, 11B, 12A, 12B
			5	13A, 13B, 14A, 14B, 15A
			6	16A, 16B, 17A, 17B
			7	17C, 17D, 18A, 19A
			8	20A, 20B, 21A, 21B
			9	22A, 23A, 24A, 24B
			10	25A, 30B, 31B, 34A, 34B, 35A
			11	26A, 27A, 27B, 28A
			12	29A, 29B, 29C, 30A
			13	31A, 32A, 33A, 33B, 36A
			14	37A, 37B, 38A, 38B, 39A
			15	40A, 41A, 41B, 42A
			16	43A, 44A, 44B, 45A, 46A
			17	47A, 47B, 48A, 49A, 50A, 50B
			18	51A, 51B, 52A, 53A
			19	54A, 54B, 55A, 55B
			20	56A, 56B, 57A
			21	58A, 58B, 58C
			22	59A, 60A, 61A, 62A, 63A
			23	64A, 64B, 65A, 66A, 67A, 68A
			24	69A, 70A, 71A, 71B
			25	71C, 72A, 72B, 73A, 74A, 75A
			26	76A, 77A, 77B, 78A, 79A
			27	80A, 81A, 82A, 82B, 83A
			28	84A, 85A, 86A, 87A, 87B
			29	88A, 89A, 90A, 90B, 91A
			30	92A, 93A, 94A, 95A
			31	96A, 97A, 98A
			32	99A, 99B, 100A, 101A, 101B
			33	102A, 102B, 103A, 103B, 103C
	Manukan	9	1	1A, 1B, 2A, 2B, 3A, 5B
			2	3B, 4A, 4B, 5A, 6A, 7B
			3	7A, 8A, 8B, 9A, 9B, 10B
			4	10A, 11A, 11B, 12A, 12B
			5	13A, 14A, 14B

PROVINCE	CITY / MUNICIPALITY	No. of Contested Clustered Precincts	Clustered Precinct Number	Clustered / Grouped Precincts
ZAMBOANGA DEL NORTE	Manukan (cont'd)		7	13B, 17A, 17B, 18A, 18B
			6	15A, 15B, 16A, 16B
			8	19A, 20A, 21A, 21B, 22A
			9	23A, 24A, 24B
	Pinan (New Pinan)	8	1	1A, 1B, 2A, 2B, 3A
			2	3B, 4A, 4B, 5A
			3	5B, 6A, 6B, 7A, 7B
			4	8A, 8B, 9A, 9B, 10A
			5	11A, 11B, 12A, 13A, 13B
			6	14A, 14B, 15A
			7	16A, 17A, 17B, 18A
			8	19A, 19B
	Pres. Manuel A. Roxas	9	1	1A, 2A, 3A, 3B
			2	4A, 5A, 5B, 6A
			3	6B, 7A, 7B
			4	8A, 8B, 8C
			5	9A, 10A, 10B
			6	11A, 11B, 11C, 11D
			7	12A, 12B, 13A, 13B
			8	14A, 14B, 15A, 15B
			9	16A, 16B
	Sergio Osmeña Sr.	6	1	1A, 1B, 2A
			2	3A, 4A, 4B
			3	5A, 5B, 6A
			4	7A, 7B, 7C, 8A
			5	9A, 9B, 10A, 10B, 11A
			6	12A, 12B, 13A, 13B
	Siayan	15	1	1A, 1B, 2A, 3A
			2	3B, 4A, 4B, 5A
			3	6A, 6B, 7A, 7B
			4	8A, 8B, 9A, 9B
			5	10A, 11A, 12A, 12B
			6	13A, 14A, 15A
			7	16A, 17A, 17B, 18A, 18B
			8	19A, 19B, 20A
			9	20B, 21A
			10	22A, 23A, 23B
			11	24A, 25A, 26A
			12	27A, 27B, 28A, 29A, 29B
			13	30A, 30B, 31A, 32A
			14	33A, 33B, 34A, 35A
			15	36A, 36B, 37A
Sibutad	9	1	1A, 1B, 2A, 2B, 3A, 3B	
		2	4A, 4B, 5A, 6A, 7A	
		3	7B, 8A, 8B, 9A, 10A	
		4	11A, 11B, 12A, 12B	
		5	13A, 14A, 14B	
		6	15A, 15B, 15C, 16A	
		7	17A, 18A, 18B	
		8	19A, 19B, 20A, 20B, 21A	
		9	22A, 22B, 23A, 23B, 24A	

PROVINCE	CITY / MUNICIPALITY	No. of Contested Clustered Precincts	Clustered Precinct Number	Clustered / Grouped Precincts	
ZAMBOANGA DEL NORTE	Sindangan	26	1	1A, 1B, 2A, 3A, 4A, 4B, 5A	
			2	7A, 7B, 7C, 7D, 10A, 10B	
			3	11A, 13A, 13B, 13C	
			4	16A, 16B, 17A, 17B	
			5	18A, 18B, 18C, 18D, 18E	
			6	19A, 19B, 20A	
			7	20B, 20C, 20D, 20E	
			8	21A, 21B, 22A	
			9	22B, 23A, 23B, 23C	
			10	25A, 25B, 26A	
			11	26B, 27A, 27B	
			12	27C, 27D, 27E	
			13	28A, 28B, 29A	
			14	29B, 30A, 30B	
			15	30C, 30D, 30E	
			16	31A, 31B, 32A	
			17	32B, 32C, 32D	
			18	33A, 33B, 34A	
			19	34B, 35A, 35B, 35C	
			20	36A, 36B, 37A, 37B	
			21	38A, 38B, 39A, 39B	
			22	40A, 40B, 40C, 40D	
			23	41A, 41B, 42A, 42B	
			24	43A, 43B, 43C	
			25	44A, 44B, 45A, 45B	
			26	46A, 46B, 46C, 46D, 46E	
		Sirawai	13	1	1A, 2A, 2B
				2	3A, 4A, 4B
				3	5A, 5B
				4	6A, 6B, 7A
				5	8A, 8B, 9A, 9B
				6	10A, 10B, 11A, 11B
				7	12A, 12B, 13A, 13B
				8	14A, 14B
				9	15A, 15B, 16A, 16B
				10	17A, 17B, 18A, 19A
				11	19B, 20A, 21A, 21B
				12	22A, 23A, 24A, 24B
				13	25A, 25B, 26A, 27A
		Gutalac	10	1	1A, 1B
				2	2A, 2B, 2C
				3	3A, 3B, 3C
				4	4A, 4B, 4C, 4D
				5	5A, 6A, 6B, 6C
				6	7A, 8A
				7	9A, 9B, 10A, 10B
				8	11A, 12A, 12B
				9	13A, 13B, 14A, 14B
				10	15A, 15B, 15C

PROVINCE	CITY / MUNICIPALITY	No. of Contested Clustered Precincts	Clustered Precinct Number	Clustered / Grouped Precincts		
PAMPANGA	San Fernando City	29	2	2A, 3A, 4A, 5A, 6A		
			3	7A, 8A, 9A, 10A, 11A, 12A		
			4	13A, 13B, 13C, 14A		
			5	14B, 15A, 15B		
			6	16A, 16B, 17A, 17B, 18A		
			7	18B, 18C, 18D		
			8	19A, 19B, 20A, 20B		
			9	21A, 22A, 22B, 23A, 23B		
			10	24A, 25A, 25B, 26A		
			11	27A, 27B, 28A, 28B, 29A		
			12	29B, 29C, 30A, 30B		
			13	31A, 31B, 32A, 32B		
			14	33A, 34A, 35A, 35B		
			15	36A, 36B, 37A, 37B		
			16	38A, 38B, 39A, 39B, 40A		
			18	40F, 40G, 41A, 42A		
			19	43A, 44A, 44B, 44C		
			20	45A, 45B, 46A, 47A		
			21	48A, 49A, 49B, 50A		
			22	51A, 52A, 53A, 54A		
			23	54B, 55A, 56A, 57A		
			24	58A, 59A, 60A, 61A		
			25	61B, 62A, 62B, 63A, 63B		
			26	64A, 64B, 65A, 65B		
			27	66A, 66B, 66C, 66D		
			28	66E, 66F, 66G, 66H		
			29	66I, 66J, 66K		
			30	66L, 66M, 66N, 66O		
			31	67A, 67B, 68A, 69A, 69B		
			Arayat	19	1	1A, 1B, 2A, 3A, 4A
					2	5A, 6A, 7A, 8A
	3	9A, 10A, 11A, 12A				
	4	13A, 13B, 14A, 14B, 15A, 15B				
	5	16A, 16B, 17A, 17B, 18A, 18B				
	6	19A, 19B, 20A, 21A, 21B				
	7	22A, 23A, 23B, 24A, 24B				
	8	25A, 26A, 27A, 27B				
	9	28A, 29A, 30A, 30B				
	10	31A, 31B, 32A, 32B, 33A, 33B				
	11	34A, 34B, 35A, 35B, 36A				
	12	36B, 37A, 37B, 38A, 38B				
	13	39A, 39B, 41A, 41B				
	14	40A, 42A, 43A, 43B				
	15	44A, 44B, 45A, 45B				
	16	46A, 46B, 47A, 47B				
	18	51A, 51B, 52A, 52B, 53A, 53B				
	19	54A, 54B, 55A, 55B				
	20	56A, 56B, 57A, 57B				

PROVINCE	CITY / MUNICIPALITY	No. of Contested Clustered Precincts	Clustered Precinct Number	Clustered / Grouped Precincts	
PAMPANGA	Minalin	9	1	1A, 1B, 3A, 3B, 4A, 10A, 12A	
			2	2A, 6A, 7A, 7B, 13A, 13B	
			3	5A, 8A, 9A, 9B, 11A, 11B, 14A	
			4	15A, 15B, 16A, 16B	
			5	17A, 17B, 18A, 18B, 19A, 19B	
			6	20A, 20B, 21A, 21B	
			7	22A, 22B, 23A, 24A	
			8	25A, 26A, 26B, 27A	
			9	28A, 29A, 29B, 32A	
ILOILO	Dumangas	22	1	1A, 2A	
			2	3A, 4A, 5A	
			3	6A, 6B	
			4	7A, 8A, 9A, 10A, 10B	
			5	11A	
			6	12A, 13A, 14A, 14B	
			7	15A, 16A, 16B	
			8	17A, 18A, 19A	
			9	20A, 21A, 21B	
			10	22A, 23A, 24A	
			11	25A, 26A, 26B	
			12	27A, 28A	
			13	29A, 30A	
			14	31A, 32A, 32B	
			15	33A, 34A, 35A, 36A	
			16	37A, 38A, 38B, 38C	
			17	39A, 40A, 41A	
			18	42A, 43A, 44A, 45A, 45B	
			19	46A, 47A, 48A	
			20	49A, 50A, 51A, 52A	
			21	53A, 54A, 54B, 54C	
			22	55A, 56A, 57A, 58A	
	Iloilo City	Iloilo City	64	1	1A, 1B, 2A
				2	3A, 4A, 5A, 6A
				3	7A, 8A, 9A, 9B, 9C
				4	10A, 11A, 12A, 13A
				5	14A, 14B, 15A, 16A, 17A
				6	18A, 18B, 18C, 18D
				7	19A, 20A, 21A, 22A
				8	23A, 24A, 25A, 26A, 26B, 27A
				9	28A, 29A, 29B, 29C, 29D, 29E, 29P1
				10	30A, 30B, 31A, 32A
				11	33A, 34A
12	35A, 36A, 36B				
13	37A, 38A, 39A				
14	40A, 41A, 42A, 42B				
15	43A, 44A, 44B, 45A, 46A				

PROVINCE	CITY / MUNICIPALITY	No. of Contested Clustered Precincts	Clustered Precinct Number	Clustered / Grouped Precincts			
ILOILO	Iloilo City (cont'd)		16	47A, 48A, 49A, 49B, 49C, 49D			
			17	50A, 51A, 51B			
			18	52A, 53A, 54A, 54B, 55A, 55B			
			19	56A, 57A			
			20	58A, 59A, 60A, 61A, 61B			
			21	62A, 62P1, 63A			
			22	64A, 65A, 66A, 66B			
			23	67A, 68A, 69A, 69B			
			24	70A, 71A, 71B, 72A			
			25	73A, 74A, 75A, 76A, 76B			
			26	77A, 78A, 79A, 80A			
			27	81A, 82A, 83A			
			28	84A, 85A, 86A			
			29	87A, 88A, 88B, 88C			
			30	89A, 90A, 91A, 92A, 92B			
			31	93A, 94A, 95A, 95B, 95C			
			32	96A, 97A, 98A, 99A			
			33	100A, 101A, 101B, 101C			
			34	102A, 103A			
			35	104A, 105A, 105B			
			36	106A, 106B, 107A			
			37	108A, 109A, 110A, 110B			
			38	111A, 112A, 112P1, 113A, 114A			
			39	115A, 116A, 116B, 116C, 116D			
			40	117A, 118A, 119A, 119B			
			41	120A, 121A, 121B, 122A, 123A			
			42	124A, 125A, 126A, 126B, 126C			
			43	127A, 128A, 129A, 130A			
			44	131A, 131P1, 132A, 132B, 132C			
			45	133A, 133B			
			46	134A, 135A, 136A, 136P1, 137A			
			47	138A, 139A, 140A			
			48	141A, 142A, 143A, 144A			
			49	145A, 145B, 145C			
			50	146A, 146B, 147A			
			51	148A, 149A, 150A, 150B, 151A			
			52	152A, 152B, 153A, 153B, 153C			
			53	154A, 155A, 156A, 157A			
			54	158A, 159A, 159B, 159C, 159D			
				Oton	15	1	1A, 1B, 2A, 2B
						2	3A, 4A, 5A
						3	6A, 6B, 7A
						4	7B, 8A, 8B, 8P1
						5	9A, 9B, 10A
						6	11A, 12A, 12B, 12P1
						7	13A, 14A, 15A
						8	16A, 19A, 24A
						9	17A, 18A, 20A, 21A

PROVINCE	CITY / MUNICIPALITY	No. of Contested Clustered Precincts	Clustered Precinct Number	Clustered / Grouped Precincts
ILOILO	Oton (cont'd)		10	22A, 23A, 25A, 26A
			11	27A, 28A, 28B, 28P1
			12	29A, 30A, 31A, 31B
			13	32A, 33A, 34A, 35A
			14	36A, 37A, 37B
			15	38A, 39A, 39B, 39P1
	Santa Barbara	16	1	1A, 2A, 2B, 3A, 4A
			2	5A, 6A, 6B, 8A
			3	7A, 7B, 9A
			4	10A, 11A, 12A, 12B
			5	13A, 13B, 15A, 16A
			6	14A, 14B, 17A, 17B
			7	18A, 18B, 21A
			8	19A, 20A, 22A, 22B
			9	23A, 24A, 25A, 26A
			10	27A, 28A, 29A, 29B
			11	30A, 31A, 32A, 33A, 33B
			12	34A, 34B
			13	35A, 35B, 36A, 36B
			14	37A, 38A
BULACAN	Sta. Maria	23	1	1A, 2A, 2B, 2C, 3A
			2	4A, 4B, 5A, 5B, 6B
			3	6A, 7A, 7B, 8A
			4	9A, 10A, 11A, 12A
			5	13A, 13B, 13C, 14A, 32B
			6	14B, 15A, 16A, 16B, 17A
			7	18A, 19A, 19B, 20A, 20B, 21A, 32C
			8	21B, 21C, 22A, 22B, 22C, 23A, 24A
			9	23B, 25A, 26A, 27A, 28A, 28B, 29C
			10	29A, 29B, 30A, 31A, 31B, 32A
			11	33A, 33B, 34A, 34B
			12	35A, 35B, 36A, 36B, 37A
			13	38A, 39A, 39B, 40A, 41A
			14	42A, 43A, 43B, 44A, 44B
			15	45A, 45B, 46A, 47A, 48A
			16	48B, 49A, 49B, 50A, 50B, 50C
			17	51A, 51B, 51C, 52A
			18	51D, 53A, 54A, 54B, 54C
			19	55A, 55B, 56A, 57A
			20	58A, 58B, 58C, 59A
			21	59B, 60A, 61A, 61B
			22	62A, 63A, 63B, 64A
			23	65A, 65B, 66A, 66B, 66C

PROVINCE	CITY / MUNICIPALITY	No. of Contested Clustered Precincts	Clustered Precinct Number	Clustered / Grouped Precincts
BULACAN	Bocaue	20	1	1A, 1B, 2A, 3A, 4A
			2	5A, 8A, 8B, 10A, 10B
			3	6A, 6B, 7A, 7B, 9A
			4	11A, 12A, 12B, 13A, 14A
			5	15A, 15B, 16A, 17A, 18A
			6	19A, 20A, 21A, 21B
			7	22A, 23A, 24A, 25A, 26A
			8	27A, 28A, 29A, 30A, 30B
			9	31A, 32A, 33A, 33B, 34A
			10	35A, 36A, 37A, 40A
			11	38A, 38B, 39A, 41A, 42A
			12	43A, 44A, 44B, 45A
			13	46A, 46B, 47A, 47B
			14	48A, 48B, 49A, 50A
			15	51A, 52A, 53A, 55A
			16	54A, 54B, 55B, 55C, 59C
			17	55D, 55E, 55F, 55G
			18	55H, 55I, 55J, 55K
			20	56A, 56B, 56C, 56D
			21	56E, 56F, 56G, 56H
			QUEZON	Lucena City
2	5A, 7A, 7B, 12A			
3	6A, 8A, 10A, 11A			
4	13A, 14A, 15A, 17A, 17B			
5	16A, 16B, 18A, 18B, 19A, 20A			
6	21A, 21B, 22A, 22B			
7	23A, 24A, 24B, 25A, 26A			
8	27A, 28A, 29A, 29B, 30A, 40A			
9	31A, 32A, 33A, 34A, 34B, 37B			
10	35A, 36A, 37A, 38A, 39A			
11	41A, 41B, 42A, 42B, 43A, 43B			
12	44A, 44B, 45A, 45B, 46A, 48B			
13	46B, 47A, 47B, 48A, 49A			
14	50A, 52A, 52B			
15	51A, 53A, 53B			
16	54A, 54B, 55A, 56A			
17	57A, 57B, 58A, 59A			
18	60A, 61A, 62A, 62B			
19	63A, 73A, 73B, 74A, 75A			
20	64A, 70A, 71A, 72A			
21	65A, 66A, 67A, 68A, 69A			
22	76A, 76B, 77A, 78A			
23	79A, 80A, 81A, 81B, 82A, 82B			
24	83A, 83B, 84A, 85A, 86A			
25	87A, 88A, 89A, 90A, 92B			

PROVINCE	CITY / MUNICIPALITY	No. of Contested Clustered Precincts	Clustered Precinct Number	Clustered / Grouped Precincts			
QUEZON	Lucena City (cont'd)		26	91A, 91B, 92A, 93A			
			27	94A, 94B, 95A, 97A			
			28	94C, 96A, 102A, 103A			
			29	94D, 103B, 104A, 105A			
			30	94E, 105B, 106A, 106B			
			31	98A, 99A, 100A, 101A			
			32	107A, 107B, 108A, 108B, 109A			
			33	110A, 111A, 112A, 112B			
			34	113A, 114A, 115A			
			35	116A, 119A, 120A			
			36	117A, 118A, 123A, 124A			
			37	119B, 121A, 122A			
			38	125A, 128A, 128B, 135A			
			39	126A, 126B, 127A, 136A			
			40	129A, 130A, 130B, 132A			
			41	131A, 133A, 134A, 137A			
			42	138A, 138B, 138C, 139A, 139B, 140A			
			43	141A, 145A, 152A, 153A, 154A			
			44	142A, 143A, 144A, 144B, 151A			
			45	146A, 146B, 147A, 148A			
			46	149A, 150A, 162A, 164A			
			47	155A, 158A, 159A, 160A, 161A			
			48	156A, 157A, 172A, 180A, 181A			
			49	163A, 166B, 169B, 173A, 174A, 175B			
			50	165A, 166A, 167A, 168A			
			51	169A, 170A, 171A, 176A			
				Pagbilao	10	1	1A, 1B, 2A, 3A, 4A
						2	4B, 5A, 5B, 6A
						3	7A, 7B, 8A, 8B, 9A
						4	9B, 9C, 9D, 10A
						5	11A, 11B, 11C
		6	12A, 12B				
		7	13A, 13B, 13C				
		8	14A, 14B, 14C				
		9	15A, 15B, 16A, 16B, 17A, 17B				
		10	18A, 18B, 19A, 19B				
		Perez	8	2	3A, 3B, 4A, 4B		
				3	5A, 5B, 6A, 6B, 7A		
				4	8A, 9A		
				5	10A, 10B, 11A, 11B		
				6	12A, 12B, 13A, 14A, 14B		
				7	15A, 15B		
				8	16A, 16B, 17A, 17B, 18A		
				9	19A, 19B, 20A, 20B, 21A, 21B		

PROVINCE	CITY / MUNICIPALITY	No. of Contested Clustered Precincts	Clustered Precinct Number	Clustered / Grouped Precincts
QUEZON	San Antonio	11	1	1A, 1B, 2A, 3A, 4A, 4B
			2	5A, 6A, 6B, 7A, 8A, 8B
			3	9A, 9B, 10A
			4	11A, 11B, 12A, 12B
			5	13A, 13B, 13C, 14A
			6	15A, 15B, 16A
			7	17A, 17B, 18A, 19A, 19B
			8	20A, 20B, 21A, 21B
			9	22A, 22B, 23A
			10	24A, 24B, 25A, 25B
			11	26A, 26B, 27A, 28A
	San Narciso	13	1	18A, 22A, 25A, 25B, 27P1
			2	19A, 19B, 20A, 24A
			3	21A, 21B, 23A, 23B
			4	26A, 27A, 27B
			5	28A, 28B, 29A, 29B, 29P1
			6	30A, 30B, 31A, 32A, 32B, 32P1
			7	33A, 34A, 34B, 35A, 36A
			8	37A, 37B, 37C, 38A, 38B, 38P1
			9	39A, 40A
			10	41A, 41B, 42A, 43A, 43P1
			11	44A, 44B, 45A, 45B
			12	46A, 47A, 48A, 48P1
			13	49A, 50A, 50B, 51A, 51B, 52A, 52P1
	Gumaca	20	1	1A, 2A, 3A, 4A
			2	5A, 6A, 6B, 7A
			3	8A, 9A, 10A, 10B
			4	11A, 11B, 12A
			5	13A, 14A, 14B
			6	15A, 16A, 17A
			7	18A, 19A, 20A
			8	21A, 22A, 23A
			9	24A, 24B, 25A, 25B
			10	26A, 27A, 28A, 29A
			11	30A, 31A, 32A, 33A
			12	34A, 35A, 36A, 37A, 38A
			13	39A, 40A, 41A
			14	42A, 43A, 43B
			15	42B, 42C, 42D, 42E, 42F

PROVINCE	CITY / MUNICIPALITY	No. of Contested Clustered Precincts	Clustered Precinct Number	Clustered / Grouped Precincts
QUEZON	Gumaca (cont'd)		16	44A, 45A, 45B
			17	46A, 47A, 48A, 49A
			18	50A, 51A, 52A, 53A
			19	54A, 55A, 56A
			20	57A, 57B, 58A
	Real	8	1	1A, 1B, 2A, 2B, 3A
			2	3B, 4A, 4B, 5A, 5B, 8A
			3	5C, 5D, 6A, 6B, 7A, 7C
			4	7B, 8B, 9A, 9B, 9C
			5	10A, 10B, 10C
			6	11A, 11B, 13A, 13B
			7	12A, 12B, 12C
			8	14A, 14B, 14C, 15A

663

SET Case 001-16 (Tolentino vs. De Lima)
Pilot Precincts for Annulment of Election Results

PROVINCE	CITY / MUNICIPALITY	No. of Contested Clustered Precincts	Clustered Precinct Number	Clustered / Grouped Precincts
SULU	Indanan	1	7	15B, 16A, 16B, 16C
	Maimbung	3	19	18A, 18B
			31	50A, 51A, 52A, 53A
			41	57A
	Old Panamao	2	23	95A, 96A, 97A, 98A, 99A
			26	105A, 105B, 105C
	Parang	1	28	76A, 77A
	Patikul	1	15	41A, 42A, 43A, 44A, 45A, 46A
Siasi	1	45	134A, 134B, 135A	
Tapul	2	4	9A, 9B	
		8	17A, 18A, 19A	
BASILAN	Al-Barka	13	1	15A, 15B, 16A, 16P1
			2	28A, 29A, 29B, 30A, 30P1
			3	31A, 32A, 32P1
			5	42A, 42B, 43A, 43B, 43P1
			7	80A, 81A, 81B, 81P1
			8	82A, 83A, 84A, 84P1
			9	85A, 85B, 86A, 87A, 88A, 88P1
			10	89A, 90A, 90B, 90P1
			11	91A, 92A, 92P1
			12	93A, 93P1
			13	99A, 100A, 101A, 101P1
			14	104A, 105A, 106A, 106B, 106P1
			15	113A, 114A, 114P1
	Sumisip	4	5	10A, 11A
			10	23A, 23B, 24A
			12	28A, 28B
			30	69A, 70A, 71A
	Akbar	3	1	11A, 12A, 12B
			3	50A, 50B, 50C
			11	69A, 70A, 70B
Tabuan-Lasa	3	2	2A, 2B, 2C, 2D	
		7	10A, 10B, 11A	
		14	26A, 27A, 28A	
MAGUINDANAO	Barira	2	12	27A, 27B, 28A, 28B
			17	40A, 41A, 42A, 43A
	Datu Blah T. Sinsuat	4	11	15A, 16A, 17A, 17B, 18A
			16	25A, 25B
			17	26A, 27A
			18	28A, 29A
Mangudadatu	1	7	10A, 10B, 11A	
Datu Hoffer Ampatuan	1	6	18A, 19A, 20A, 21A	
LANAO DEL SUR	Ganassi	4	11	14A
			20	26A
			21	27A
			32	44A, 45A, 46A, 46B

PROVINCE	CITY / MUNICIPALITY	No. of Contested Clustered Precincts	Clustered Precinct Number	Clustered / Grouped Precincts
LANAO DEL SUR	Bacolod-Kalawi (Bacolod Grande)	2	5	6A, 6B
			6	7A, 7B
	Butig	1	18	39A
	Kapai	2	2	3A
			14	18A, 19A
	Lumba-Bayabao (Maguing)	1	27	27A
	Madamba	4	2	4A
			6	11A, 12A
			19	32A
			22	36A, 37A, 37B
	Malabang	3	23	95A, 95B
			39	129A
			41	132A
	Marantao	1	8	15A, 15B
	Marawi City	2	9	12A, 13A, 14A, 15A, 16A
			91	200A, 201A, 201B
	Poona Bayabao (Gata)	4	7	7A
			10	10A
			12	12A, 12B
			24	23A, 23B
	Tubaran	1	14	24A, 25A
	Tugaya	1	14	23A, 23B
	Calanogas	1	7	7A, 7B
Buadiposo-Buntong	7	7	12A	
		9	15A	
		11	18A	
		15	25A, 25B	
		16	26A, 27A, 28A	
		25	43A, 43B	
		32	56A, 56B	
Picong (Sultan Gumander)	4	1	1A, 1B, 1C	
		3	3A, 3B	
		4	4A, 4B, 4C, 4D	
		16	16A, 16B	
LANAO DEL NORTE	Sultan Naga Dimaporo (Karomatan)	7	11	44A, 44B, 44C, 44P1
			23	73A, 74A, 74P, 74P1
			24	75A, 76A, 77A, 78A, 79A
			25	80A, 81A, 82A, 82P1
			35	105A, 106A, 107A, 108A, 110A
			47	147A, 148A, 149A, 150A, 151A, 152A, 152P1
			49	156A, 157A, 158A, 159A, 160A, 160P1
NORTH COTABATO	Pikit	1	31	80A, 81A, 81B, 82A, 82B